Overall Results Framework of the UNESCO 2003 Convention

What role for the NGOs?
Why a Framework?

- Unesco IOS asks Secretariat in 2013
  - Good governance
  - Like other conventions

- Is 2003 Convention working?
  - How to measure it?

- Safeguarding = change things
Building the Framework

- **8.COM; 9.COM**
- **Category VI expert meeting in Beijing in 2016**
- **Open-ended working group in Chengdu (China) in 2017**
  - Proposed document from the Secretariat
  - Several NGOs were present to work on the indicators along with experts and State parties
- **Adoption by the Intergov. Committee and by the GA in 2018**
- **Planned to be use within the renewed states periodic reporting**
The indicators

• Reliable, consistent over time
• Simple to collect and analyse
• Affordable, cost-effective data collection
• Valid, measure what is intended
• Sensitive to changes
• Useful for decision-making and learning

• 8 thematic areas
• 26 core indicators
• 86 assessment factors
## Table 1 (pt. 2): Themes and brief indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thematic Areas</th>
<th>Institutional and human capacities</th>
<th>Transmission and education</th>
<th>Inventorying and research</th>
<th>Policies as well as legal and administrative measures</th>
<th>Role of intangible cultural heritage and its safeguarding in society</th>
<th>Awareness raising</th>
<th>Engagement of communities, groups and individuals as well as other stakeholders</th>
<th>International engagement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Core Indicators (brief)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Competent bodies support practice and transmission</td>
<td>4. Education, both formal and non-formal, strengthens transmission and promotes respect</td>
<td>7. Inventories reflect the diversity of ICH and contribute to its safeguarding</td>
<td>11. Cultural policies and legal and administrative measures reflect diversity of ICH and are implemented</td>
<td>15. Importance of ICH in society widely recognized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Programmes support strengthening human capacities for safeguarding</td>
<td>5. ICH integrated into primary and secondary education</td>
<td>8. Inventories process is inclusive, respects diversity, and supports safeguarding by communities and groups</td>
<td>12. Education policies and legal and administrative measures reflect diversity of ICH and are implemented</td>
<td>16. Inclusive plans and programmes recognize the importance of safeguarding ICH and foster self-respect and mutual respect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Training is operated by or addressed to communities and those working in the fields of culture and heritage</td>
<td>6. Post-secondary education supports safeguarding and study of ICH</td>
<td>9. Inventories contribute to safeguarding</td>
<td>13. Policies and legal and administrative measures respect customary rights, practices and expressions</td>
<td>17. Communities, groups and individuals participate widely in awareness raising</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table 2: Indicators and assessment factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thematic Areas</th>
<th>Core Indicators</th>
<th>Assessment According to the Following</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Transmission and education  | 5 Extent to which ICH and its safeguarding are integrated into primary and secondary education, included in the content of relevant disciplines, and used to strengthen teaching and learning about and with ICH and respect for one’s own and others’ ICH | 5.1 ICH, in its diversity, is included in the content of relevant disciplines, as a contribution in its own right and/or as a means of explaining or demonstrating other subjects.  
5.2 School students learn to respect and reflect on the ICH of their own community or group as well as the ICH of others through educational programmes and curricula.  
5.3 The diversity of learners’ ICH is reflected through mother tongue or multilingual education and/or the inclusion of ‘local content’ within the educational curriculum.  
5.4 Educational programmes teach about the protection of natural and cultural spaces and places of memory whose existence is necessary for expressing ICH. |
| Citations¹                 |                                                                                 | Article 14(a)(i)  
OD 107,  
OD 180(a)(ii)  
Article 14(a)(i)  
OD 105,  
OD 180(a)(i)  
EP 11  
OD 107  
Article 14(c)  
OD 155(e),  
OD 180(d)  
EP 5 |
‘Extent to which…’ - many actors

- Framework includes both initiatives of communities, groups and individuals and interventions of State or others, outside the communities

- Extent to which never means: ‘Extent to which the State Party has done X or accomplished Y’, since many actors are involved
‘Extent to which…’ - two levels

- **Global level**: the proportion or percentage of States Parties in which the given situation exists or change has been achieved, and to what degree

- **Country level**: the degree to which that given situation exists or change has been achieved, within the territory of that State
What role for the NGOs?

- ONG strategic/action plans (Tapis Plein)
- Collaboration ONGs+ and States
  - Same information for all stakeholders
- Tracking obstacles and areas of performance
- Political/admin. tool at national level
- Somehow difficult to fill in the Overall results framework…
Preliminary constatations

1- It generally seems difficult to use the indicators of the framework to qualify the elements of the ICH as a whole without falling into a work of varying relevance;
1.1- Qualitative evaluation will need new methods of accounting: « the extent in which inventories contributes to safeguard ICH »…; 1.2- It appears easier to report the breaches than the compliance…;
2- An element-based approach might often be more appropriate for identifying potential changes in the management of ICH (in the name of ICH or not), and could lead to better collaboration of sectoral NGOs both together and with States (see eg. "Cultural traditions of Quebec in figures" of the CQPV);
3- The indication of the number of full-time cultural staff working in the area(s) under consideration may be in some cases interesting and relatively easy to compare with other sectors of culture, including volunteers;
4- The various National Statistical Institutes can hardly play a leading role in this ICH venture, for several reasons;
5- In addition to this accountability dimension, the global framework can also act as a guide in the strategic planning of NGOs, ICH institutions, or states (see Tapis Plein NGO).

Measuring Culture’s contribution in Agenda 2030 SDGs
LE PATRIMOINE CULTUREL IMMATÉRIEL VU PAR

LES PRATICIENS

LES ETHNOLOGUES

LE MINISTRE DE LA CULTURE

LES FONCTIONNAIRES

LES MUNICIPALITÉS

L'HOMME DE LA RUE
Changes induced notably by collecting datas on ICH in Québec

• Shows NGOs can do serious work by measuring ICH
• Shows the prominent work done by NGOs in safeguarding ICH
• ICH exists for real!
• **New specific program** for the transmission of traditional music and dance
• Towards putting in place documented **safeguarding plans**
• **New call for projects** by the Ministry of Culture ($ for NGOs)
• Discussions with art councils on public support for ICH elements
• Guidebook for municipalities **in collaboration** with the Ministry of Culture, with increasing interest and projects done locally
• New studies on the need for training and new $ for transmission at the Ministry of Employment
• And more to come!
Questions? Remarks?
Join the working group and share your future experiences!
Thank you!